1 2 3 4 5 6 7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 8 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT TACOMA 9 10 CASE NO. 2:21-cv-01004-RJB-JRC JOJO DEOGRACIAS EJONGA, 11 Plaintiff, ORDER ADOPTING REPORT AND 12 RECOMMENDATION AND REv. REFERRING CASE 13 CHERYL STRANGE; MICHAEL OBENLAND; ERIC JACKSON; JOHN 14 DOE; CAROL SMITH; JANE DOE; JACK WARNER; LEE STEMLER; ALEX 15 WANTANBE; ARBEN KULLOJKA; JON DOE, 16 Defendants. 17 This matter comes before the Court on the Report and Recommendation of U.S. 18 Magistrate Judge J. Richard Creatura (Dkt. 101) and the Plaintiff's motion for an extension of 19 time to file a response to the Defendants' objections (Dkt. 104). The Court has considered the 20 Report and Recommendation, objections to the Report and Recommendation, the pleadings filed 21 regarding the motion, and the file herein. 22 On August 30, 2022, the Report and Recommendation was filed, recommending that 23 Defendants Jackson, Obenland, Strange and Warner's motion to dismiss Plaintiff's Eighth 24

ORDER ADOPTING REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION AND RE-REFERRING CASE - 1

1 2 3

Amendment claim be denied and that the motion to drop Defendants Smith, Warner, Stemler, Wantanbe and Kullojka as misjoined be denied. Dkt. 101. The Defendants filed objections to the Report and Recommendation. Dkt. 104. The Plaintiff filed a motion for a six-day extension of time to file a response to the Defendants' objections (Dkt. 104) and then filed the response (Dkt. 107).

**Motion for Extension of Time**. Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 16, the Court may grant an extension of time for good cause. The Plaintiff's motion for a six-day extension of time (Dkt. 104) should be granted. He has stated sufficient good cause. His response to the Defendants' objections (Dkt. 107) should be considered.

Report and Recommendation and Defendants' Objections. The Report and Recommendation should be adopted and the Defendants' motions (Dkts. 67 and 69) should be denied. The Defendants maintain in their objections that the Plaintiff's Eighth Amendment claim should be dismissed because he has failed to state a claim and because they are entitled to qualified immunity. Dkt. 103. As stated in the Report and Recommendation, the Plaintiff has plausibly stated a claim for violation of his Eighth Amendment rights and, at this point in the litigation, the Defendants are not entitled to qualified immunity (which can be raised, if appropriate, by a motion for summary judgment).

The Defendants further object to the Report and Recommendation's recommendation that the newly joined parties remain in the case. Dkt. 103. They contend it is a "violation of the separation of powers" - between the Congressionally set fee requirements in the Prison Litigation Reform Act ("PLRA") and this Court - to allow the Plaintiff to amend his complaint and add these new parties and claims. *Id.* They also argue that it is a violation of Fed. R. Civ. P. 20, "Permissive Joinder of Parties," to allow these new parties to remain in the case. *Id.* As stated in

1	the Report and Recommendation, the Defendants read the PLRA and Rule 20 too narrowly.
2	Construing the complaint liberally, the claims are plausibly related and all deal with the
3	Defendants' responses to COVID-19 and their treatment of the Plaintiff. The Report and
4	Recommendation should be adopted and the newly added parties and claims should not be
5	dropped.
6	Re-referring Case. This case and all pending motions should be re-referred to Judge
7	Creatura for further proceedings.
8	<u>ORDER</u>
9	Therefore, it is hereby <b>ORDERED</b> that:
10	• The Plaintiff's motion for a six-day extension of time (Dkt. 104) <b>IS GRANTED</b> ;
11	• The Report and Recommendation (Dkt. 101) <b>IS ADOPTED</b> ;
12	<ul> <li>The Defendants' motions (Dkts. 67 and 69) ARE DENIED; and</li> </ul>
13	The case and all pending motions <b>ARE RE-REFERRED</b> to Judge Creatura for
14	further proceedings.
15	The Clerk is directed to send uncertified copies of this Order to all counsel of record and
16	to any party appearing <i>pro se</i> at said party's last known address.
17	Dated this 19 <sup>th</sup> day of October, 2022.
18	Kaket Fryan
19	ROBERT J. BRYAN
20	United States District Judge
21	
22	
23	

24